**‘Singing my Sister Down’ by Margo Lanagan**

**Horrific punishment**

– Deliberately publically shamed (forced to sink in full view of the village. Family are also publically shamed by association)

- Physical punishment (capital) sinking in tar as a form of public execution.

**Effects:**

* Ik’s brother, a small boy, is stoic (strong) in the face of punishment and does not break down until the punishment is over.
* The boy is deeply traumatised by the punishment of his sister. He states that “everything went slippery in his mind” and he becomes lost and unable to function on his own.
* Mumma does not want someone she loves going through the same punishment as Ik, so she warns her son about who he loves and not getting himself in a situation where this punishment will be the result.
* The family are ashamed and shamed by association, even though they did not commit the crime.
* Loss of a family member.

‘**Dear Mr Cairney’ by Graeme Lay**

**Horrific punishment**

– Deliberately publically shamed (calling him by his surname, making him stand up in front of the class)

- Physical punishment (corporal) strapped three times, then forced to clean a gutter with his injured hand, then strapped again.

**Effects:**

* The boy is stoic (strong) in the face of punishment and refuses to break down until the punishment is over.
* The boy is traumatised by the punishment. He remembers it twenty years later, in vivid detail, suggesting it is burned in his memory.
* He does not want someone he loves going through the same punishment, so he warns Mr Cairney in order to prevent it.
* Feels ashamed because of the punishment but he does not understand why.
* The boy has no respect for Mr Cairney as an authority figure.

**Comparisons (compare and contrast):**

* The punishments in both texts are public shaming and physical punishment. However, one is corporal punishment and the other is capital punishment.
* Both boys are strong in the face of punishment, although one is receiving the punishment and the other is watching the punishment. However, they both fall apart when the punishment is over. This suggests that watching a punishment is just as hard as receiving it when it involves someone we love, and it has an effect on those watching too rather than just the receiver.
* Both boys are traumatised by the punishment. In ‘DMC,’ the boy vividly remembers it 20 years later, suggesting that it was a significant and hard time for him. In ‘SMSD’ the boy falls apart completely and is unable to function on his own. It seems that this will also be a major event in his life.
* In both texts, punishment leads to a warning to protect loved ones. While the past pupil in ‘DMC’ received the punishment and warns Mr Cairney against punishment against his son, the mother in ‘SMSD’ watched the punishment but still warns her son against making choices that will result in the same punishment as Ik.
* Punishment can often lead to a sense of shame, even if the punishment is not deserved or is unfair. In ‘DMC’ the boy feels ashamed due to Mr Cairney’s actions. Shame is also linked with punishment in ‘SMSD’ although in this text it is the whole family who must endure the shame.
* Unfair punishments can lead to a loss of respect for those abusing their authority. The past pupil has no respect for Mr Cairney due to his unfair treatment because he could not understand the reason for the punishment. This differs from ‘SMSD’ as Mumma understands that “this is what they do, what they have to do.” She accepts the punishment because it is something that has been done before for the same crime and therefore she understand and her sense of justice is not offended and there is not sense of anger at the Chief for his decision to execute Ikky. Suggests that if punishment is deserved it is a little easier to accept.

**Horrific punishments and its effects on people**